**中欧公职人员养老保障制度改革**

**国际研讨会综述**

**Review of the International Workshop on**

**Public Pension Reform**

国家发展和改革委员会就业和收入分配司

**Department of Employment and Income Distribution**

**National Development and Reform Commission**

（2015年2月16日）

**(Feb. 16, 2015)**

2015年2月2-3日，中欧社会保障改革合作项目“公职人员养老保障制度改革国际研讨会”在比利时布鲁塞尔顺利召开。本次会议由国家发改委就业和收入分配司、欧盟社会保护项目联合体共同主办，比利时联邦公共服务社会保障部承办，会议得到了欧盟委员会的协助支持。中方团队由国家发改委就业收入分配司、国际合作中心相关同志，中国社会科学院、中央财经大学、西南财经大学的社保专家学者同时邀请世界银行社保专家组成。意大利、比利时、法国、西班牙等项目成员国的代表，欧盟委员会、世界银行、OECD、奥地利科学院等国际组织机构的专家学者以及荷兰、芬兰等国养老金管理机构的代表参加了会议。

The *International Workshop on* *Public Pension Reform of China-EU Social Protection Reform Project* (SPRP) was held successfully in Brussels from February 2 to 3, 2015. The workshop was organized by the Department of Employment and Income Distribution of China’s National Development and Reform Commission (NDRC) and the Consortium, the project’s European implementing agency, and hosted by DG Strategy Research and International Relations, Belgian Federal Public Service. The workshop also gained support and assistance from the European Commission. The Chinese team consists of officials from the Department of Employment and Income Distribution and the International Cooperation Centre of the NDRC, scholars of social protection from Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Central University of Finance and Economics, Southwestern University of Finance and Economics, and social security experts from the World Bank Group. Representatives from SPRP member states of Italy, Belgium, France and Spain, experts and scholars from international organizations of the European Commission, the World Bank, Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development(OECD) and the Austrian Academy of Sciences, and representatives from the pension management institutions in Netherlands and Finland also participated in the workshop.

比利时养老金部丹尼尔.巴奎兰部长、意大利社会保障署司长加布里尔.尤斯里先生和纪宁副司长分别致辞，双方充分肯定中欧社会保护合作项目的重要意义。纪宁介绍了项目发起、设立和推进的过程，谈到中方对此项目高度重视，在经济社会发展新常态下，社会保障体系成为与工业化、城镇化、就业和收入分配等宏观调控政策密不可分的一项重要制度。在过去20多年中，中国社保体系快速发展，在扩大覆盖面、提高人民群众制度保障和水平方面取得了很大成就，但也面临着诸多挑战，中共十八届三中全会以来机关事业单位养老金制度的建设正成为当前一项重要改革任务。在此背景下，召开本次会议具有重要意义。

The Belgian Minister of Pensions Daniel Bacquelaine, Director Gabriel Uselli of INPS, and Deputy Director General Ji Ning of NDRC highly recognized the significance of SPRP. Ji Ning introduced how the project was launched, set up and developed and pointed out that China highly valued this project. In the new normal of social and economic development, the social security system becomes increasingly involved with macro-control policies on industrialization, urbanization, employment and income distribution. In the past two decades, China’s social security system has developed rapidly and made remarkable achievements in expanding coverage, improving institutions and raising social security level. There are, however, still many challenges facing China. After the Third Plenary Session of the 18th Central Committee of the CPC, pension system reform of government agencies and public institutions becomes an important task. Under such background, this workshop is highly relevant.

作为中欧社会保护项目启动的第一次国际性研讨会，“公职人员养老保障制度改革”议题的选择，旨在适应我国社会保障事业发展的新常态要求，探讨欧盟国家公共部门养老改革的国际经验教训，为下一步实施机关事业单位养老保险制度改革提供借鉴。两天的议程分为五个单元，十几位中外专家学者围绕主题发表演讲，并进行了充分的互动和广泛的交流。现将会议主要研讨内容和观点综述如下：

*Public Pension Reform* is the first international workshop of SPRP. The topic is designed to accommodate the new normal of China’s social security and aims at learning from the experience and lessons of EU countries in this field. It will guide the public pension system reform in China. The two-day agenda consists of five seminars. A dozen of Chinese and foreign experts and scholars gave lectures and fully interacted with participants. Summary of the main content and opinions are as follows:

**一、关于全球和欧盟养老金改革总体形势**

1. Pension reform in EU and the world at large

随着人口老龄化的冲击，尤其是2008年以来金融危机的影响，全球养老金制度改革面临越来越大的压力。来自世界银行的王德文先生介绍了全球养老保险改革的趋势，指出各国养老金制度在扩展覆盖面、提高待遇水平和财政支出等方面正面临着诸多挑战。为此，各国不同程度地采取了参数性或结构性的改革措施，包括引入社会养老金计划、发展第二支柱养老金、将DB型养老金转变为DC型、提高退休年龄、调整待遇指数化规则及计发办法等等。

The ageing population and the financial crisis since 2008 has brought growing pressure to global old-age pension system reform. Mr. Wang Dewen from the World Bank Group introduced the global trends of pension reform. He indicated that major challenges nowadays lie in coverage expansion, pension benefit level and fiscal expenditure improvement. To this end, many countries takeindex or structural reform measures at different levels, including building social old-age pension scheme, developing second pillar, transitioning from DB (defined-benefit) scheme to DC (defined-contribution) scheme, raising retirement age, and adjusting benefits indexation rules and methods.

OECD社会政策部的莫尼卡.奎赛尔主任对近年来OECD国家强制性公共养老金计划的改革状况和特点进行了全面总结：从指标数据上看，OECD各国的养老金替代率和老年人就业率呈现出很大差异，一个新出现的现象是贫困由老年人向青年人转移。在2012至2014年期间，低经济增长、低投资回报、财政压力增大等方面的因素加剧了OECD国家养老金改革的压力，一些现收现付制公共养老金制度的财务可持续性恶化，私人养老金系统的回报率大幅下降。

Monika Queisser, Head of the Social Policy Division at the OECD, reviewed OECD countries' compulsory public pension scheme reforms in recent years and summarized their features. According to the indicators, there is a huge difference between pension replacement rate and employment rate at older age. An emerging trend is that poverty goes to the younger groups. From 2012 to 2014, low economic growth, low investment return and growing financial stress have intensified the pressure on pension reform in OECD countries. Financial sustainability of some public pension on pay-as-you-go (PAYG) basis continues to deteriorate. The return rates of private pension systems have sharply declined.

为此各国均采取了相应的改革措施，其中首要举措是将退休年龄标准由65岁提高到67岁，男女的退休年龄有趋同的趋势，也有一些国家建立了一定的弹性退休机制。其次，是扩大公共养老金制度和私人养老金计划的覆盖范围。第三，出台工作激励措施，减免继续工作老年人的相关税费，严格限制提前退休。第四，调整养老金指数化方法，改变养老金指数化规则。第五，提高养老基金管理效率，降低养老基金管理费用。总体上看，OECD国家养老金制度的财政可持续性在增强，但待遇水平的充足性则有所下降，未来改革仍面临着多方面的考验。

To address the challenges, OECD countries have taken countermeasures. First, to increase the retirement age from 65 to 67. The retirement age for women and men is to be equaled. Some countries set up flexible retirement scheme. Second, to expand the coverage of public and private old-age pension schemes. Third, to introduce incentive measures to cut related tax of the working senior people and strictly limit early retirement. Fourth, to adjust pension indexation method and rules. Fifth, to improve pension fund management efficiency and reduce the administrative expenses. In general, fiscal sustainability of national pension systems in OECD countries is improving, while adequacy of benefit decreases. Reforms in the future are still faced with multiple tests.

欧盟委员会就业总司的弗里特.范.诺德海姆司长重点介绍了欧盟在协调各国养老金制度中的作用。2008年债务危机以来，很多欧洲福利国家养老金支出面临很大的财政约束压力。为此欧盟对各国提出了经济、财政、就业和社会政策方面的建议，并加强对成员国养老金制度的跨界监管。其中一个重要的方面是协调养老金政策的平等性，即如何衔接跨国流动人口的养老金待遇问题，这对中国养老保险制度的跨地区转移接续有借鉴意义。

Fritz von Nordheim, Director of DG Employment of European Commission, mainly introduced EU’s role in coordinating pension systems of different countries. Since the 2008 debt crisis, many European welfare states are under great pressure in pension expenditure. To tackle this problem, the European Commission gave suggestions on economic, financial, employment and social policies, and strengthened cross-border supervision among EU member states. One major dimension is to coordinate equality of old-pension policies, i.e. to transfer old-age pension of international migrants smoothly. This holds experience to cross-region transferability of pension schemes in China.

**二、关于欧洲一些国家公共养老金制度的改革经验**

**2. Experience of public pension reform in EU countries**

意大利、西班牙和比利时等国政府社会保障管理部门的代表，介绍了本国公共养老保障制度的改革趋势和经验教训。西班牙就业和社会保障部社会保障规划司的拉斐尔.巴贝拉司长介绍了该国公共养老金制度的改革情况。西班牙公共养老金分为两个层次：第一层次的非缴费型养老金于1990年引入，使无经济来源的人都得到保障。目前约覆盖1%人口，待遇水平约为5136欧元/每年，全部支出占GDP的0.2%左右。第二层次为缴费型收入关联的现收现付养老保险计划，分为针对雇员的“普通计划”和针对自雇者的“单独计划”两种。为了改善财政可持续性，西班牙拟在收入关联养老金中引入两个因素：一是可持续性因子，将待遇水平与预期寿命关联；二是指数化调整因子，将调待系数与整个制度的参保状况、收支状况相关联。此外，该国还计划将退休年龄逐步提高到67岁，并采取新的社保征缴体制，以增加保费收入。

Representatives of social security management agencies from Italian, Spanish and Belgian governments introduced trends and experience of public pension system reform in their countries. Rafael Barbara, Director of Social Security Division, Ministry of Employment and Social Security, introduced the reform in Spain. There are two categories of pension in his country: contributory and non-contributory. Non-contributory pension was introduced in 1990, which covered all people with no income. Non-contributory pension covers 1% of Spain's population now, with an average benefit level of about 5136 euro/year. Total pension expenditure accounts for 0.2% of the GDP. Contributory pension is an earning-related PAYG old-age insurance scheme. It has common scheme for employees and individual scheme of the self-employed. In order to improve fiscal sustainability, Spain is expected to introduce two factors in earnings-related contributory pension system: the sustainability factor, which links pension level with life expectancy; and the indexation adjustment factor, which links benefit adjustment index with the participation and payment of the entire system. In addition, Spain also plans to gradually increase the retirement age to 67 years old, and adopt a new collection and payment system to increase premiums.

比利时联邦公共服务社会保障部战略研究和国际关系司的科恩.弗莱明克斯司长做了题为“走向牢固可靠的社会相约：比利时养老金制度新结构性改革”的演讲。该国养老金制度正面临着战后婴儿潮、预期寿命延长、高支出和高债务带来的冲击，其养老金替代率低于OECD平均水平，但支出GDP占比却高于OECD平均水平，同时就业方式、婚姻结构、社会信任等方面的变化也带来了相应挑战。为此，2013年比利时政府制定了2020-2040年的养老金改革计划，提出进行结构性改革的设想，包括采用积分制待遇确定方式、限制提前退休、降低公务员特殊权利、延迟退休年龄和发展第二支柱等方面的改革措施，但到目前该国养老金改革措施的推行还相当有限。

Koen Vleminckx, Head of DG Strategy Research and International Relations, Belgian Federal Public Service, gave a speech of “Towards Stronger Social Engagement: Structural Reform on Pension System in Belgium”. Belgium’s pension system is being challenged by post-war baby boom, extension of life expectancy, high expenditure and heavy debt. Belgium’s replacement rate is lower than the OECD average, while its expenditure as a share of GDP is higher. Changing patterns of employment, marriage and social trust are also threatening the system. In 2013, Belgium government unveiled 2020-2040 pension reform plan. The plan is a structural reform, including defined-point distribution, limiting early retirement, cutting special benefits of public officials, increasing retirement age and developing the second pillar. In effect, the reform has not yet fully implemented by now.

意大利社会保障署的安东内诺.克鲁多副司长介绍了意大利公共养老金体系1992年、1995及2012年以来的几次改革过程及制度变化情况，并指出了低参保率、公私部门待遇差以及离职金等方面存在的问题。

Antonello Crudo, Deputy Director of INPS, introduced Italian public pension system reforms and system changes in 1992, 1995, 2012 and thereafter. He touched upon problems, including low participation rate, treatment difference between public and private sectors, and severance pay.

此外，比利时国家养老金办公室的管理人员还介绍了该国养老金制度的基本运营情况，通过现场PPT，向与会者介绍了该国养老金体系的信息管理系统，对养老金待遇发放资格认证过程中的申请提交、信息跟踪、资料审核以及待遇支付确认等步骤做了具体演示，并就数据库建设和养老金转移接续等问题进行了现场交流。

Besides, managers from Belgian National Pension Office further introduced with slides the fundamental operation of Belgian pension system. They presented the information management system of the pension system and showed steps to approve pension entitlement and payment, from application submission, information track, profile review and pension payment confirmation. The communication on database setup and pension transferability was carried out on the site.

**三、关于欧洲一些国家职业养老金计划发展的新趋势**

**3.** **New trends in the development of national occupational pension scheme in**

**some European countries**

建立公职人员职业养老金计划是公共部门养老金制度改革的一个重要保障。近年来，部分欧盟国家出台职业养老金计划立法和优惠政策，鼓励第二支柱保障的发展，取得了良好效果。来自法国、荷兰、芬兰和比利时的养老金管理机构代表分别介绍了各自的发展经验。

Establishing occupational pension schemes for public officials will safeguard the pension reform of public sector. In recent years, some EU countries have launched occupational pension legislation and policies to encourage the second pillar support, which turns out to be effective. Representatives of pension management agencies in France, Netherland, Finland and Belgium introduced their development experience respectively.

法国公共服务部门补充养老金计划管理部的菲利普.德佛赛重点介绍了法国公共部门补充养老金计划（ERAFP）。他指出在经济社会发生新变化背景下，现收现付计划的监管越来越难。ERAFP计划是一个集合缴费确定型计划（CDC），待遇采用积分制，基金采取多元化投资策略，注重社会责任投资，建立起的较为科学透明的治理结构，是个综合施策的一揽子计划。为什么要给公务员额外补给？实际上补充保险要达到多重目标，退休金的公平性，科学预测寿命周期，确定养老金的水平，退休金只能以基本工资为缴费基数，超出工资收入的20%不再计入工资中。将缴费年限变成积分，由此换算成待遇。同时追求养老金投资回报的盈利率。近年来取得了良好业绩。

Phillip Decipher from ERAFP (Etablissement de Retraite Additionnelle de la Fonction Publique) introduced France's additional pension scheme for public sectors. He pointed out that as the economy and society are undergoing new changes, it becomes more difficult to regulate the PAYG scheme. ERAFP is a collective defined contribution scheme (CDC). The pension is point-based, and funds are invested in a diversified portfolio, which focuses more on social responsibility. ERAFP has a more transparent and scientific governance structure. This is a package plan with comprehensive measures. Why give additional pension to civil servants? Actually ERAFP has multiple goals, such as equal retirement pension, science-based life expectancy predict and pension level determination. Contribution base is the basic salary and income that exceeds 20% of the salary will be included. The contribution period will be turned into points and further calculated into entitled benefit. At the same time, it tries to get higher profitability of pension investment. ERAFP has great performances in recent years.

荷兰APG集团的彼特.哥特扎克西先生介绍了管理职业养老金方面的经验。APG集团创建于2008年，是荷兰国内最大的养老基金管理公司之一，所管理的养老金参保成员有400多万人，全球资产达3500亿欧元。荷兰的职业养老金高度发达，在三个养老保障支柱中提供40%的替代率，未来的养老基金管理将更加注重多元化、风险平衡和个人自由选择权。

Mr. Peter Gothzacks from Netherlands APG group introduced the experience in occupational pension management. APG group, founded in 2008, is one of the largest pension fund managementcompanies in Netherlands. APG managed over 4 million pensioners. Global assets of the group is as high as 350 billion euros. Netherlands has highly developed occupational pension, which offers 40% of replacement rate among three pillars. In the future, management of old-age pension funds will be more diversified, risks-balanced, and offer discretion to individuals.

芬兰养老金管理集团的艾伦.波洛尼厄斯先生介绍了管理公职人员职业养老金计划的经验。Keva集团是一家独立的国营公司，负责地方政府和公共部门雇员的第二支柱强制性收入关联型养老金计划的管理和基金投资。2014年参保成员有130万人，基金资产约415亿欧元；历史上芬兰地方政府和公共部门的养老金计划为DB型现收现付制，待遇过于慷慨，财政负担沉重。从上世纪80年代开始逐步经历改革，建立起了储备基金，并削减待遇水平，向私人部门养老金计划看齐。2015年的养老金改革建议书已提交国会，约2017年有望实施，未来的一个重要任务是进一步提高计划的基金筹资积累。

Mr. Allen Polonius from Finland Pension Management Group introduced the management experience of occupational pension schemes for public sector. Keva Group is an independent state-owned company, responsible for the management and fund investment of the earning-related compulsory pension scheme for local government and public sector (the second pillar). In 2014, there were 1.3 million pensioners, with fund asset amounting to 41.5 billion euros. In the past, pension scheme of local government and public sector is a pay-as-you-go DB scheme. The scheme was too generous to sustain. Since 1980s, Finland set up reserve funds, cut the payments and learnt from the private sector. In 2015, the Pension Reform Suggestion Plan has been submitted to the Congress, which is expected to be effective in 2017. One important step ahead is to further improve financing of the planned scheme.

比利时金融服务和市场监管局（FSMA）的格哈德.基斯尼克先生介绍了该国补充养老计划近年来快速发展的情况。比利时的第二支柱职业养老金目前约有11万个计划，覆盖250万人口，资产达700亿欧元。职业计划分为行业性的集体计划和单个公司发起计划两大类，由商业保险公司和养老基金公司两类机构管理，大部分为DC型模式，待遇一次性领取，税收优惠为10-20%。

Gerhard Kieschnick from the Belgium Financial Services and Market Regulation Agency (FSMA) introduced the rapid development of additional pension scheme in Belgium in recent years. The second pillar occupational pension system now has about 110,000 schemes, covering 2.5 million people with asset amounting to 70 billion euros. Occupational schemes consist of sectoral collective pension scheme and individual corporation pension. The second pillar is managed by commercial insurance companies or pension funds. Most of them are on a DC basis and once paid all with a tax cut as high as 10-20%.

2004年出台的补充养老金法对行业性职业养老金计划的发展起到了极大促进作用，使计划覆盖率提高到75%左右，该法案规定在投资上雇主要保障3.25%的最低回报率和最终责任。近年来，比利时政府还进一步提出了延迟退休金领取年龄、发展年金产品市场以及提高计划信息透明度等方面的做法，多策并举鼓励年金第二支柱的发展。

*Law on Additional Pension* promulgated in 2004 has vigorously promoted the development of sectoral occupational pension scheme. The law helped raise the coverage to 75%. The law stipulates that in case of investment, employers should ensure a 3.25% minimum return rate and claim ultimate responsibility. In recent years, Belgian government has taken more measures to encourage the development of the second pillar, such as increasing pension distribution age, developing annuity products market, improving transparency of information.

四、我国机关事业单位养老金制度改革的比较借鉴

4. Comparison with China's public pension reform

中国社会科学院美国所所长郑秉文教授在题为“中国机关事业单位养老金碎片化改革——全球比较角度”的演讲中，回顾了中国机关事业单位养老金制度的历史和现状，对中外社保制度的“碎片化”情况进行了四个维度的比较，分析了整合碎片的改革动力学，最后提出下一步我国机关事业单位养老金改革应着重关注的几个问题，包括加强顶层设计、引入精算技术的重要性以及财政配套资金支出的必要意义等。

Professor Zheng Bingwen is the dean of Institute of American Studies, Chinese Academy of social sciences. In his speech “Fragmented Public Pension Reform in China — a comparative study globally”, he reviewed the past and present of the pension system for Chinese public sector. Social security system in China was compared with those of other countries in four dimensions. He further analyzed the reform dynamics of integrating the fragments. He pointed out several focal points in future reform, including strengthening top-level design, and introducing actuarial techniques and fiscal support.

西南财经大学的林义教授综合分析了中国养老保障制度改革的经济社会条件，指出在老龄化、工业化、城镇化、信息化进程中，新常态下养老保险改革面临着种种挑战，各项改革推进措施受经济、政治、社会及文化因素的制约。展望未来的改革，需要对政府与市场的边界、正式制度与非正式制度的融合以及多层次保障体制的构建做出重新思考。

Professor Lin Yi from Southwestern University of Finance and Economics analyzed the economic and social background of China’s pension system. He pointed out that as China continues the ageing, industrialization, urbanization, and IT application processes, pension system reform is confronted with economic, political, social and cultural constraints. To facilitate future reform, it is necessary to have a fundamental rethink of the boundary between government and market, integration of formal and informal systems, and building of multi-tiered social security system.

中央财经大学的褚福灵教授在“中国公共部门养老保障制度发展历程和改革经验”的主题演讲中，对中国公职人员的范围、公职人员养老金制度改革的历史进程、改革后制度的基本架构以及其中的基本经验进行了详细阐述。

In another keynote speech "development and reform experience of China’s old-age security system in the public sector", Professor Chu Fuling from Central University of Finance and Economics explained in detail the scope of "public officials", development of pension system reform for public officials, basic structure after the reform and lessons learnt.

奥地利科学研究院的罗伯特.霍斯曼教授就养老金制度改革的政治经济环境条件和社会动力问题做了专题演讲。他指出养老金改革的政治经济学是一个研究难题，改革动力来自财政压力、创新和挤出效应等多个方面。推动改革成功的因素包括建立承诺、形成社会共识、营造制度环境以及实施操作四个方面的步骤，这些都需要具备相应的匹配条件和计划安排措施。

Professor Robert Haltzman from Austria Institute of Science gave a lecture on political and economic environment and social motivation of pension system reform. In his view, political economics issues are a major difficulty, including financial pressures, innovation and "crowding out effect". To have a successful reform, we cannot ignore social commitment, social consensus, favorable environment and practical operation. All these four steps require matching conditions and plans.

五、欧盟国家养老金制度改革的启示与借鉴

5. Inspiration and reference from pension system reform in EU countries

两天的讨论，带给我们许多新的政策、新的想法、新的体验和新的趋势，了解到了欧洲很多新的政策信息和实践经验，了解到了全球尤其是欧洲的养老金制度全面发展趋势，有很多启发。自上世纪70年代以来，养老金制度不断面临改革的挑战，公共部门与私人部门养老金存在着诸多差别并具有不同的解决方案，基于养老金是对未来的一种社会承诺，因此，建立职业养老金的两个重点是投资和年金市场问题。概括起来有这样几点：

The workshop presents us new policies, new ideas, new experience and new trends. We touched on novel policies and practices in Europe. Participants are greatly inspired by the global trend of pension reform, especially that of EU. Since the 1970s, constant challenges pushed us to innovate the pension system. Pension systems in public and private sectors are quite different and require different solutions. To set up occupational pension scheme, investment and annuity market are two focal points.

一是养老金改革是世界性发展趋势。比较突出的变化是全球采用待遇确定型（DB）模式的国家越来越少，退休金计划正在向缴费确定型（DC）转变，采用混合式账户的越来越多，而名义资产也是养老金资产这一观点被更多地认同。但总起来看，改革并没有统一的标准，往往都是从养老金可持续性发展来考虑，因为，世界各国都面临人口老龄化带来的养老金财务压力，人群覆盖率及体现保障水平的替代率等指标变化上。

First, reform of pension system is a general trend globally. Around the globe, a prominent change is that less countries adopt DB scheme. Retirement pensions are transitioning to DC schemes with more mixed accounts. It is gradually accepted that nominal assets are also pension assets. There is no fixed standard to evaluate the success of reform, while sustainability of the pension is generally accepted. This is a result of financial pressure of distribution brought by the ageing population, changes of coverage rate and replacement rate that indicates social security level.

二是注重发挥职业年金等第二支柱的作用。欧洲职业养老金计划发展很快，这也是个普遍的发展趋势，大多设立了不同类型的职业养老保险制度，体现了制度的多层次性。在养老金体系供应方面有可借鉴之处，例如，荷兰的APG退休金集团，作为欧洲最大的退休金集团涵盖了所有的养老保险层面，有非常新的管理理念。芬兰的Keva集团作为职业退休金的管理者，经历过几个时期的改革，在芬兰改革预筹积累的现收现付制计划中，发挥了重要作用。再如，比利时的公务员补充养老金在2004年的立法之后获得了快速发展，政策措施可资借鉴。

Second, we should effectively utilize the second pillar. Occupational pension schemes have developed rapidly in Europe. This is a general trend worldwide. Most countries have set up occupational pension insurance systems of different kinds showing multiple tiers of the system. China has much to learn in pension system supply. For instance, the Netherlands APG pension group, Europe's largest pension group, covers all levels of old-age insurance. The group holds new management ideas. Keva Group in Finland is professional pension management institution. Keva played an important role in PAYG reform plans in Finland after rounds of reforms. Another example is the Belgium civil service additional pensions. CSAP gained rapid growth since the legislation in 2004. These policy measures can be an reference for China.

三是借鉴欧盟养老金参数不断调整变化的经验。任何一项制度不可能一成不变，随着人口年龄结构、经济发展、财政状况及抚养比的变化，各国都对制度设计的一些参数进行了适度调整，体现了制度设计的弹性。这对中国是非常有用的信息，对完善中国养老金制度有很好启示。例如，提高退休年龄、调整领取条件、调整待遇指数化内涵和标准政策等参数性改革措施。以期不断修正完善养老金制度，满足外界条件变化和人们多样化需求，并使制度安全平稳运行。

Third, we should learn from EU in adapting the pension index to changes. No system stays the same. As demographic, economic and financial status and dependency ratio change, most countries adjusted the system index. Flexibility of the system is good for China and a good inspiration for China's pension system improvement. To meet the changing external conditions and diversified demand and achieve a smooth operation, we can adjust and improve pension system by increasing retirement age, adjusting entitlement, adjusting the indexation of benefits andstandard policies.

四是经济社会发展形势与养老金制度发展密切关联。在欧盟经济整体复苏回暖并不明显、不确定的背景下，尤其是人口老龄化的日趋严重，对养老金制度运行影响巨大。法国认为，在经济发展遭遇困境，财政不堪重负情况下，养老金制度变得难以持续，必须做出积极回应，改革非常迫切。同时，退休金制度一定要追求平衡，不仅是各类群体待遇水平的平衡，更要关注养老金的收支平衡和长期可持续的平衡。

Fourth, the evolution of pension system goes in line with economic and social development. Against the backdrop of uncertain recovery of EU Economy, especially the growing ageing population, the pension system is severely affected. According to France, in the economic and financial trap, the pension system is hard to sustain. It is imperative to respond and reform actively. At the same time, retirement pension system should achieve balance in distribution for different groups, as well as in payments and long-term sustainability.

由此联想到，中国在经济新常态下如何应对未来——老龄化高峰来临的养老金支付压力，可借鉴欧洲应对债务危机的一些做法，包括降低中低收入纳税人所得税负担，调整养老保险费率、领取退休金年龄及待遇水平等一系列政策。同时，特别保证最低收入者各项生活补助。从而保证中低收入者消费，刺激拉动经济增长，维护养老金等保障制度的良性循环、持续运转。

We can learn from the experience of Europe in handling of the debt crisis, as China is also struggling to cope with the pressure brought by the ageing population and the new normal of economy. A series of policies are available, such as relieving the burden of mid-low income tax payers, adjusting old-age insurance rates, retirement age and payments. It is also important to guarantee the allowances for the lowest income group. These measures will ensure the consumption of low-income consumers, stimulate economic growth, maintain a virtuous growth and sustainability of the security systems including old-age pension systems.

五是机关事业单位养老保险制度改革中需深入探讨的问题。2013年11月，我国进行了全面深化改革的总体设计，在建立更加公平可持续的社会保障制度中，提到坚持社会统筹和个人账户相结合的基本养老保险制度，完善个人账户制度。而政府有关部门及业内较有共识的是个人账户从FDC转向NDC，这是一个非常重要的改革决策，并非常明确地体现在年初颁布的机关事业单位养老保险制度改革方案中。

Five, more specific issues are to be explored in public pension reform. In November 2013, China unveiled national overall design of deepening reform. To build a more equitable and sustainable social security system, it is required to continue the basic pension system that combines social pool and personal accounts, and to improve individual accounts system. It is generally accepted among government departments and sectors to turn individual accounts from FDC to NDC. This important reform decision is clearly stipulated in the Pension System Reform Act for public sector enacted earlier this year.

从欧盟国家公职人员养老金制度的经历，联想到在下一步改革实施中，还需要深入研究一些实际问题。如，与企业职工保险有差异的是，同步建立的职业年金在养老金替代率中占有相当的比重，而企业年金则非强制。那么，封闭运作的机关事业养老保险基金公职人员向企业流动时，基金如何转移划拨，过渡期不同的“中人”如何平滑过渡等，这些都要在实施细则中有明确的规定。

From the experiences of public pension system development in EU countries, we can find there are more specific areas to be studied in implementation. For instance, the difference between occupational pension and employment insurance. Occupational pension takes a large proportion in replacement rate, and enterprise insurance is not compulsory. In implementation rules, therefore, there should be detailed guidance on the transition of pension fund from public sector to the business sector, on how the fund is remitted and on facilitating the transfer of entitlements for different people during the process.